

TERMS OF REFERENCE
REVIEW OF COST EFFECTIVENESS OF JOBS PROJECTS IN THE FORCED
DISPLACEMENT CONTEXT

I. PROJECT BACKGROUND

1. Summary

DFID, UNHCR, and the World Bank Group have joined forces under a DFID Trust Fund to identify questions that are under-researched, of global interest, and highly policy-relevant on the topic of forced displacement as it relates to health, education, social protection, and jobs. Forced displacement refers to situations of persons who leave or flee their homes due to conflict, violence, persecution and human rights violations. The initiative will finance large multi-country multi-partner research projects that address such global questions.

Within the initiative, the World Bank's Jobs Group will fund one or several research projects. The present Terms of Reference (ToR) is for research on the cost of jobs interventions in the context of forced displacement and contexts that can furnish a useful point of comparison.

2. Context

There are 68.5 million forcibly displaced people worldwide. The majority are internally displaced within their own country, while 25.4 million are refugees who have crossed at least one international border.¹ Since World War II, the dominant response to refugees has been 'care and maintenance', in most part through the United Nations High Commissioner for Refugees (UNHCR). This approach assumed that refugees were temporarily displaced and would soon return to their homes. Today, however, it is evident that protracted displacement crises are the norm, affecting two-thirds of all refugees, and refugees and IDPs are likely to remain displaced for many years. The agreed-upon definition of 'protracted refugee situation' according to UNHCR are those which have been in exile for five consecutive years or more after their initial displacement, without immediate prospects for implementation of durable solutions². Funding to support forcibly displaced individuals totaled US\$12 billion in 2014, or 50% of total humanitarian spending. Of those, US\$6.4 billion were for situations that could already be classified as protracted displacement³.

In recognition of the long-term nature of many displacement situations, there is a clear policy shift from humanitarian to development interventions. This implies an increase of funds dedicated to livelihood interventions. Between 2011 and 2012, there was a 25% increase in funding for livelihood programs, and an additional 15% in 2013. For refugees, access to labor markets is key for becoming self-reliant, rebuilding their lives and securing dignity. The shift is also deemed important and necessary given that forcibly displaced individuals must move towards further self-sufficiency as donor money, notably for protracted situations, decreases and crises increase. As the international community has begun to focus more on access to economic opportunities, it also increasingly recognizes that opportunities for the displaced must go hand in hand with opportunities for their hosts if the policy is going to be sustainable.

Given the mobilization of financial resources towards funding livelihood operations, it is important to determine the financial/monetary cost of such interventions in the context of forced displacement. To fully

¹ UNHCR 2018. Global Trends Forced Displacement in 2017. Geneva: UNHCR.

² UNHCR 2009. Conclusion on Protracted Refugee Situations; No 109 (LXI). Executive Committee 61st session Extraordinary Meeting: 8 December 2009. Contained in United Nations General Assembly document A/AC.96/1080

³ Crawford. N; Cosgrave. J; Haysom. N; Walicki. N, 2015. Protracted displacement : Uncertain Paths to self-reliance in exile. Humanitarian Policy Group, ODI.

understand costs in situations of forced displacement, one must compare with jobs programs in other contexts as well.

II. SERVICES REQUESTED

Research will be conducted over a period of one year with the final deliverable due on November 31, 2019.

1. **Research question: what is the cost of job interventions in contexts of forced displacements and how does it compare to interventions in other settings?**

1.1. Objectives

Work under this component must meet the following objectives:

- a) Create a comprehensive database of jobs interventions in forced displacement and comparator contexts (as defined below) including details on project design; implementation; outputs, outcomes; and costs;
- b) Determine and provide insight into the cost of project-level interventions to support job opportunities relative to the number of beneficiaries, services rendered, and outputs or outcomes;
- c) Compare cost observed in a forced displacement context to other contexts such as fragility, conflict and violent contexts (FCV);
- d) Generate insight on potential ways to improve the design of jobs interventions in each assessed context, with a view to maximize cost effectiveness;
- e) Propose implications for greater efficiency in government and aid money targeting in terms of the choice, design, and implementation of interventions, as well as in terms of populations prioritized within each type of intervention.

The conclusions and outcomes of this research will provide the World Bank, its partners and other development agencies with a greater understanding of the costs required to undertake high quality jobs interventions in the context of forced displacement. Additionally, it will provide insight on how to create efficiencies and determine potential savings in scaling interventions. This will allow for a better and more efficient use of resources.

1.2. Research design and scope

Proposals should outline in detail their approach to the following:

(a) **Research design**

The analysis should be conducted at the intervention level. Certain interventions may be part of a larger project with several components, some of which may not be related to jobs and livelihood. The review will need to define ‘stylized’ intervention types that can be compared across projects and implementers. The assessment must consider:

- The cost of each type of intervention in each setting;
- An assessment of the cost components/breakdown (fixed and variable) of the intervention and determine what drives cost in each setting;
- An assessment of cost per beneficiary, per output (service rendered), and per outcome is undertaken within each setting;
- How costs relate to the timeframe of the intervention, particularly in terms of the fixed and set up costs and any learnings on long-term savings relative to upfront costs, efficiency

improvements (costs decrease) or in changes in the choices in regards to transfers /support being made

- Cost-effectiveness analysis, as well as cost-benefit analysis when possible⁴.

(b) **Types of interventions considered.** Bidders are invited to make suggestions as to which type of jobs intervention(s) they wish to include in the review study after a thorough review of the literature on the types of interventions which are the most broadly implemented in a forced displacement context.

However, proposals must consider:

- Interventions that are widely implemented, or receive pronounced current interest as an innovative support modality over the last ten years;
- Jobs interventions that pertain to the demand side of the labor market as well as those that focus on the supply side;
- Interventions that pursue the goal of (i) increasing employment among the targeted population, (ii) increasing wages, (iii) increasing productivity, or (iv) increasing self-employment or business revenues;
- Micro and meso level interventions, rather than macro policy level ones.
- The quality of jobs created or given access to through these interventions (temporary, seasonal, informal, formal, etc.)

A highly rated proposal would be as comprehensive as possible in the types of support modalities included, and should consider:

- Skills-based interventions that seek to improve access to wage employment or self-employment;
- Capital inputs as cash or in-kind;
- Microfinance;
- Programs that directly employ refugees/IDPs;
- Value chain interventions;
- Community Driven Development or similar infrastructure based projects
- Graduation type projects which combine several of the above interventions;
- Psychosocial support.

(c) **Completeness of coverage**

Within each country included in the study, the review must consider projects (i) of types identified as relevant in the course of the literature review; (ii) carried out between 2008-2018 (i.e. including those in advanced planning or about to start), (iii) funded by DfID, UNHCR, the World Bank, as well as those multinational and bilateral development agencies and major NGOs who agree to share project data through UNHCR's coordination efforts under its mandate to coordinate all programs

⁴ Cost-benefit requires the availability of strong impact evaluations which clearly demonstrate the impact of projects. Any cost-benefit analysis proposal would have to be discussed in detail (methodology and assumptions) with the World Bank team

related to refugees; and (iv) with a jobs-relevant component with a budget of at least two million USD.

(d) Geographic scope

Proposals must cover:

- At least three Middle Eastern countries affected by the Syrian refugee crisis of which two considered [FCV](#);
- At least three African countries affected by forced displacement of which two considered [FCV](#).

The list of eligible countries (see below) will ensure a comparison between forced displacement in host countries considered FCV and other host countries. Jobs interventions in FCV countries tend to have higher associated costs. It is important to understand (i) whether the same is true for interventions operating in situations of forced displacement within non-FCV environments, and (ii) whether in addition to the costs associated with operating in an FCV environment, addressing forced displacement within such a context further raises cost. Within each country studied, the review should consider programs carried out in a forced displacement context, as well as those carried out outside of a forced displacement context (that is, programs in areas that do not host displaced populations). While these countries do not represent the exhaustive list of countries which are affected by forced displacement, they nonetheless allow for comparison between them as they represent somewhat similar contexts and circumstances. In addition, these are countries where the World Bank has an active lending portfolio.

Middle Eastern countries affected by the Syrian refugee crisis:

- Egypt
- Jordan
- Lebanon (FCV)
- Iraq (FCV)
- Turkey

African countries affected by forced displacement:

- Burundi (FCV)
- Cameroon
- Central African Republic (FCV)
- Chad (FCV)
- Congo DR (FCV)
- Congo Republic (FCV)
- Ethiopia
- Kenya
- Mali (FCV)
- Mozambique (FCV)
- Niger
- Nigeria
- Republic of Congo
- Rwanda
- South Sudan (FCV)
- Tanzania
- Uganda

1.3. Scope of work

The research team will be responsible for the following essential tasks:

a- Develop detailed literature review on available evidence

The contracted entity should conduct a literature review on the types of jobs interventions which are the most broadly implemented in a forced displacement context. Through this literature review, the research team should define ‘stylized’ intervention types and demonstrate why selected interventions merit further analysis on their costs. In addition, the contracted entity should make evident which countries they intend to focus their research on and why these countries provide a coherent story about costs in this context.

b- Develop the review study methodology

- Detail the review study plan and timeline
- Determine the inclusion criteria for the review study based on the scope outlined in section 1.2a;
- Determine categorization of interventions by:
 - Type;
 - Targeted outcomes;
 - Beneficiaries;
 - Overall service delivery package (i.e. level of comprehensiveness of the intervention);
 - etc.
- Determine database structure/ define what information will need to be collected from project documentation:
 - Such data includes but is not limited to:
 - Detailed description of the program/intervention objectives and activities
 - Source of funding
 - Start and end date
 - Description of the challenges it seeks to overcome
 - Type of job outcomes it seeks to achieve (including the quality of jobs created or given access to through these interventions)
 - Economic sector it targets
 - The types of beneficiaries targeted when possible by: age; gender; region; education level; income level (develop categories)
 - Implementation strategy
 - Budget allocation by component
 - Actual spending and disbursement by component
 - Budget/cost breakdown by input/ staff time/ and components
 - Whenever possible the consultant should gather data on outputs, outcomes and impact of the intervention to assess whether the intervention succeeded in its objectives and to what extent

- Elaborate the metrics and indicators which will be assessed as an outcome of this research. The data will be (whenever possible) re-coded into specific categories (i.e. reach in terms of beneficiaries (scale), budget size, cost per beneficiary, fixed and variable costs, length of intervention, etc.)
- Detail guidelines on data retrieval protocol, data collection method and quality control to ensure consistent and systematic data:
 - How will the contracted entity keep track of documentation collected?
 - How will it store the collected documentation (folder structure, data safety etc.)?
 - How will it record and store interviews?
- Develop the analytical model that will be used

c- Develop research tools (at a minimum)

- Develop the data collection matrix with clear explanation of each field;
- Detail interview guides for potential further qualitative information collection to complement available data with potential funding and/or implementing agency;

d- Implement

The World Bank, DFID and UNHCR will commit to sharing all relevant documentation by providing the contracted entity a package of project documents and evaluations where available, in addition to connecting the contracted entity with relevant colleagues within the organizations. The contracted entity will be responsible for contacting counterparts for any non-World Bank, DFID or UNHCR projects.

The research institutes will have full responsibility of implementing data collection and analysis

- Initiate contact with relevant counterparts as necessary to undertake a documentation collection process
- The hired contractor will collect a variety of public project documents such as documentation necessary to ascertain actions taken, their costs, outputs, outcomes, and impacts to the degree that the information is available.
- All data should be captured in English even if documentation is not in English

e- Undertake analysis

- The data analysis should seek to answer the following questions:
 - What is the average cost of an intervention? What is the spread of the costs? Maximum? Minimum?
 - How does the cost of the intervention in a forced displacement setting compare to other settings?
 - What are the costs per output/beneficiary in forced displacement? And how do these compare with other interventions? Other contexts?
 - What are the cost breakdowns in each context? How are they different?
 - What are the underlying causes of any high costs identified?

- What are the mid to long term savings?
- Are there more cost-effective ways to do these programs?

f- Develop draft and final report and presentation

- Propose a report outline based on key quantitative results;
- Based upon the outline, develop a draft report in English, in close cooperation with the World Bank task team;
- Integrate feedback from World Bank peer review process and draft a final report in English;
- Attend meetings to present final results as necessary.

1.4. *Deliverables and Schedule*

The following schedule lays out a general expectation for the time line to be followed. It can be discussed and adjusted within reason. However, there is no flexibility in extending the time line for final deliverables

Deliverables	Timeline
Inception report	10 working days from contract signature
Progress reports	Quarterly for the duration of the activity
Bibliography and literature review	November 1, 2018
Research methods note as described in 1.3(b) ⁵	November 15, 2018
Research tools as described in 1.3(c) ⁶	December 1, 2018
Prioritized interventions	February 1, 2018
Complete clean database	June 1, 2018
Report of summary statistics and summaries of qualitative work; cleaned data	July 1, 2019
Draft report outline	July 21, 2019
Draft report	August 21, 2019
Peer review matrix with responses	September 21, 2019
Final draft, data, and code for publication	November 1, 2019
Policy note and policy brief	November 31, 2019

III. Reporting relationship

Institutions involved/Governance: The study will be financed by a DFID Trust Fund. As the trustee, the World Bank is the sole implementor tasked with overseeing the study. An advisory board composed of DfID, UNHCR, the World Bank, and other experts as seen fit, will provide guidance and provide comments on key deliverables.

⁵ With the understanding that these deliverables may be edited and amended as the project progresses

⁶ With the understanding that these deliverables may be edited and amended as the project progresses

Nature of Contract between Contractor and World Bank: This is not a research grant, but a contract for consulting services for data collection and analysis. As such, the contractor will need to work within the parameters of the World Bank's General Conditions of Contract, which forms an integral part of the contract between the World Bank and the contractor. The contractor will also be accountable to the World Bank for delivering on the scope of work defined in this contract, and must duly take into account feedback received from the World Bank team in developing deliverables.

Reporting and meeting with the World Bank: The contractor is required to provide quarterly updates through progress reports in a quarterly progress meeting with the World Bank study team. Throughout the contract period, the contractor may be asked to attend other meetings (including remotely) as deemed necessary. In addition, the consultants should schedule time to present final report and findings at the end of the study period

Inputs provided by the World Bank team. The World Bank team will provide contractor comments on each deliverable in a timely fashion. It will be available to the contractor for discussion of comments and deliverables, and within reason, for the resolution of relevant questions during preparation of deliverables. It will review revised deliverables in an equally timely manner.

IV. Data Security and Management, Intellectual Property Rights and Publication

V. Data and document ownership, copyright and intellectual property right

As per the World Bank general conditions of contract (see clause 3.7), the data generated, documents, protocols, questionnaires and reports produced as part of this contract – either by the World Bank or the Consultants – is and remains the intellectual property of the World Bank. The World Bank retains copyright of all documentation that the contractor generates during the course of the contract implementation. In the MOU between DFID and the WB, the World Bank has agreed on data ownership and sharing principles with DFID, which includes making data as well as survey instruments and data collection methodologies available under the auspices of the World Bank's open data access policy. The Consultants will need to abide by these agreements and specifications. DFID, World Bank and contractor might jointly agree on academic publication opportunities, but the Consultants will not be able to publish on its own or without permission the outputs, process, outcomes or impacts of this assignment without prior notification, permission or co-authorship of the World Bank.

VI. Publication

The World Bank reserves the right to publish all deliverables as World Bank working papers, other World Bank publications or any other academic publication, in agreement with DFID.

After results have been published, the data, survey instruments and data collection methodologies will be made available online.

VII. Eligibility criteria and minimum qualifications

The World Bank has minimum eligibility criteria which must be adhered to. In addition, the research will require a minimum set of qualifications in order to be able to undertake the assignment.

1. Minimum Eligibility

- Minimum 1 year in business;
- No more than 20% of revenue from World Bank;
- Appropriate business licenses/certifications;

- Acceptance of World Bank Group terms and Conditions.

2. Minimum qualifications

- The contracted organization must have proven experience in the field of economic evaluations, cost-effectiveness/cost-benefit analysis and in developing complex financial models. In addition, must have experience working in forced displacement and/or FCV contexts;
- Principal Investigator (PI) must hold a PhD and have at least 10 years of experience in similar projects
- Track-record managing large contracts;
- Bidders must have experience in engaging in similar type of projects with the World Bank or similar institutions.

VIII. Application process and Evaluation criteria

1. Application process

The following table shows the requested application materials and timeline: Stage of application process

	Deadline
Selected entities must submit a full proposal	TBD
Applicants will be notified whether they have been chosen	TBD
Contract will be signed	TBD

The page limit does not include attached letters or other documents specifically requested in this ToR.

2. Evaluation Criteria

Criteria	Definition	Weight
Methodological strength/ Technical design	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Are the proposed methods able to provide strong quantitative evidence? • Does the research design appropriately answer the questions outlined in the proposal? Are there threats that could compromise the validity of results? If so, does the proposal sufficiently address those threats? What changes could the researchers make to improve the design? 	35
Qualifications of research team	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Has the research team undertaken similar studies before? • Do they have the technical and subject expertise? 	35
Cost-effectiveness	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Is the cost of the study commensurate with the expected output and contribution to the field? 	30